THE CITY OF DORAVILLE
AGENDA ITEM SHEET

Subject: LED Retrofit Contractor Recommendation

Date of Meeting: August 2, 2010

Budget Impact: □Yes ■ No

Budget Impact Amount: $ 0

Funding Source:

□ Annual
□ Capital
■ Grant
□ N/A

Regular Meeting ■
Work Session □
Recommendation ■
Policy/Discussion □
Report ■
Other □

CITYOFDORAVILLE CITYOFDORAVILLE CITYOFDORAVILLE CITYOFDORAVILLE CITYOFDORAVILLE

Action Requested: Approve staff recommendation for contractor

History, Facts, Issues: Project is fully funded through the EECBG program. It includes retrofitting City Hall, Civic Center, Courthouse, Library and Arena with LED fixtures.

Options: Staff recommends E. Sam Jones Distributor, Inc. based in Smyrna

Recommended Action: Vote

Department: Administrative

Department Head: Mayor

Administrative Comments and Recommendation: None

Action Taken By Board: N/A

the city of Doraville℠

DIVERSITY | VITALITY | COMMUNITY

STAFF REPORT **JULY 27, 2010**

TO: **HONORABLE MAYOR & COUNCIL MEMBERS**

FROM: **LUKE HOWE, ASSISTANT TO THE MAYOR**

RE: **LED RETROFIT PROJECT CONTRACTOR RECOMMENDATION**

After several weeks of research and evaluation, staff recommends E. Sam Jones Distributor, Inc. of Smyrna for the LED Interior Retrofit Project. The Project is 100% funded by the U.S. Department of Energy's (DOE) Energy Efficiency Community Block Grant (EECBG), a program authorized by the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA). The program is being administered locally by the Georgia Environmental Finance Authority (GEFA).

The Project was originally proposed to be completed in two phases. The total project includes retrofitting City Hall, Civic Center, Courthouse, Library and Arena. The total cost was estimated at $221,000. Initially, $192,500 was going to fund the first deployment, and phase two would commence when the difference ($28,500) was made in energy and maintenance savings. In reviewing the three proposals submitted, however, it looks like the City will be able to complete both phases at once.

LED RETROFIT PROJECT PROPOSERS				
Firm	**Headquarters**	**Product Warranty**	**Workmanship Warranty**	**Proposed Bid (total)**
Best Green Solution	Montgomery, AL	5 years	1 year	$192,150
E. Sam Jones	Smyrna, GA	5 years	1 year	$202,869
Queen Capital	Buford, GA	5 years	Unknown	$227,410

E. Sam Jones (ESJ) originally proposed $221,774.50 for both phases, but since the proposals were opened, staff has successfully negotiated the total price down to $202,869 by eliminating proposed LED fixture installations in the Honeysuckle Park field houses and the Arena locker room. ESJ also lowered their "installation per fixture price" on the LED 2x2 troffer and the 4 LAMP T-5HO highbay fixtures that will be installed in the Arena gymnasium, replacing the inefficient and yellow-tinted high pressure sodium

(HPS) lamps. Once the HPS lamps are replaced in the Arena, the gymnasium will look totally different under the proposed white light highbays.

It should be noted that the DOE has recognized that when it comes to some fixtures, namely T-8 tube lights and highbays, ultra-lumen fluorescent fixtures are superior to the LED. In light of that, the City has obtained permission from GEFA to use ultra-lumen fluorescents instead of the LED highbay and T-8s.

As you can see from the scope of work illustration, 83% (465/560) of the new fixtures will be LED and 18% will be the ultra-lumen fluorescents, which outperform their LED counterpart.

SCOPE OF WORK			
EXISTING SYSTEM		**PROPOSED SYSTEM**	
Existing Fixture Type	**Qty**	**Proposed Fixture Type**	**Qty**
4 Lamp T12 2x4 troffer	346	LED 2x2 troffer	439
2 Lamp T12 strip	6	Retrofit with 28W T8	6
400 watt HPS highbay	32	4 Lamp T5 HO highbay	32
Downlight	7	LED Downlight	7
2 Lamp 8 ft. strip	54	4 - 4' 28W T8 kit	54
Incandescent keyless	3	Compact fluorescent	3
2x2 T12 U 6 Lamps	20	LED 2x2 troffer	19
Total Existing	**468**	**Total Proposed**	**560**

Why E. Sam Jones?

Based in Atlanta with offices in Chicago, Houston, Los Angeles, Nashville and New Jersey, E. Sam Jones has been in business for 60 years. Every year since 1995, ESJ has been recognized by *Electrical Wholesaling Magazine's* "Top 200" distributors. In taking a "turnkey" approach to this project, ESJ will be responsible for the procurement, installation and the disposal/ recycling of old fixtures in a manner consistent with EPA regulations.

ESJ carries a wide array of brands such as Cree, Sylvania, Halo and the DeKalb-based Lithonia and Illumitron products. Based in the Raleigh-Durham area, Cree is known to be the best of the best in LED lighting. Cree and possibly a mixture of Lithonia and Illumitron will be installed depending on which product is the best fit for a particular fixture or building. Each of the three products are UL tested and carry the LM 79 or LM 80 ENERGY STAR® rating. They also come in "Cool" "Soft" and "Warm" light producing variations.

Other key factors in this recommendation include a $2.8 million contract that the State recently awarded to ESJ to retrofit parking garages, the State Capitol Building and the Governor's Mansion. According to the State Building Authority and GEFA, ESJ emerged from crowded field of bidders after undergoing a rigorous selection process. ESJ has also contracted with:

- Grady Hospital (parking garage for Selig Parking)
- Marine Corps Logistics Base – Albany, GA
- Woodruff Arts Center
- Elgin Air Force Base – Ft. Walton Beach, FL
- University of Memphis (gymnasium)

ESJ also submitted letters of recommendation from other customers such as Chevron, Energy Systems Group (ESG), Georgia Power, Hines and Parkway Realty Services.

According to Benn Webb, the Woodruff Arts Center's engineer, "E. Sam Jones is top notch. They did a fantastic job installing our T-8s, which have produced a 25-30% return on investment. I would highly recommend E. Sam Jones."

According to Brian Yoblon of Selig Parking, "E. Sam Jones came in and installed 800 fixtures in parking garages used by Grady Hospital in a week and a half. We do a lot of work with them, and their service is second to none. Most distributors are pushing a particular brand. With E. Sam Jones, you get a wide variety of first rate fixtures."

As a testament to his products, ESJ Vice President, Tom Davis, offered a single phase deployment. The $10,369 difference between the $192,500 phase one budget and the $202,869 total cost could be paid back through the savings produced with zero interest. In other words, Mr. Davis will receive increment payments from the City for the difference as savings are produced, or we could elect to hold off on the Civic Center until savings merit.

As for disposal, ESJ partners with Southeast Recycling who provides an EPA approved certificate for disposals.

Why not Best Green Solution?

Ken Frame's Best Green Solution is based in Montgomery, AL. Although Frame submitted the lowest bid, his product, the Clean-Light-Green-Light (CLGL) T-896 is a LED converted fluorescent. In other words, Frame removes the ballasts and fluorescent bulbs from T-8 and T-12 fixtures and replaces them with polycarbonate LED bulbs.

This method of engineering has been met with skepticism from the DOE. Below is a quote (June 2010) from Jim Brodick, head of the DOE's Solid State Lighting (SSL) program on the LED T-8s and tube replacements…

"…in this country alone there are tens of millions of recessed… 4' fluorescent T8 lamps in use… and a ton of LED products being touted as energy-saving "drop-in" equivalents… those LED products are a far cry from matching the performance of fluorescent T8s, it all adds up to a surefire recipe for consumer disappointment."

"when it comes to general ambient lighting for offices and other commercial spaces, LED T8s have not proven competitive with linear fluorescent lamps. This is not a vague impression "sensed" from the marketplace; it's a DOE finding based on careful analysis and testing results from DOE's CALiPER program…testing have shown that LED T8s produce far less light than the fluorescents they're intended to replace, out of proportion to the energy savings."

"the average initial bare-lamp light output of the LED replacement products was only about one-third of the average for the fluorescent lamps tested – with the best-performing LED T8 producing only half of the light output of a typical 4' fluorescent. Not exactly what I'd call a stellar performance.

"Solid-state lighting technology is improving all the time, but for now, when it comes to LED replacement T8s, the best policy is to "just say no."

To read the entire article, go to:

http://apps1.eere.energy.gov/buildings/publications/pdfs/ssl/postings_06-11-10.pdf

Although Frame has done work for a handful of cities and a few large corporations such as Sherwin Williams, he has never been awarded a contract in the State of Georgia or the entire southeastern United States for that matter. Mr. Frame's company is not licensed to do business in this state nor is it clear who would actually be installing his CLGL product, a brand that most industry experts have never heard of. The RFP clearly asked proposers to attach their licenses and certifications and Mr. Frame did not.

Why not Queen Capital?

For one, Queen's bid was too high. Staff specifically solicited "turnkey" contractors, meaning the contractor would be responsible for light procurement, installation, service and disposal of old fixtures. Regina Williams, CEO of Queen Capital, did not include disposal fees in her bid. She proposed charging $3.50 per ballast disposed. Without any ballast count, the final price is an unknown quantity. Ms. Williams, like Mr. Frame, is pushing a particular brand. In this case, LEDtronics fixtures would be used. Like CLGL, LEDtronics is not a marquee brand in the lighting industry.

If you have any questions or concerns about my recommendation between now and August 2, please don't hesitate to call me.

Respectfully submitted,

Luke Howe