

Approved
Prisby / Willett

MINUTES
VILLAGE OF HINSDALE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
November 9, 2016 (Special Meeting)
Memorial Hall – Memorial Building, 19 East Chicago Avenue, Hinsdale
6:00 P.M.

Chairman Bohnen called the special meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) to order at 6:00 p.m. on November 9, 2016, in Memorial Hall in the Memorial Building, 19 East Chicago Avenue, Hinsdale IL.

Present: Chairman Bohnen, Commissioner D’Arco, Commissioner Willet and Commissioner Prisby
Absent: Commissioner Gonzalez and Chan Yu, Village Planner
Also Present: Director Robb McGinnis; Applicants for Case HPC-03-2016 & HPC-04-2016, and Ms. Karen Keefe, Executive Director of the Hinsdale Library

Minutes

Chairman Bohnen introduced the minutes from the October 12, 2016, meeting. Chairman Bohnen requested to change a word from “as” to “than” in the minutes. He next asked for any changes from the Commissioners. With none, Chairman Bohnen asked for a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner D’Arco made a motion and Commissioner Prisby seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Findings and Recommendations – Recommendations forwarded to the next Board of Trustees meeting.

Case HPC-01-2016 – 306 S. Garfield Avenue Local Landmark Application. (The applicant is nominating the home at 306 S. Garfield Avenue AND the coach house at 26 E. 3rd Street for designation of a Local Landmark. On October 12, 2016, the HPC recommended landmarking the structures separately to reflect the two separate parcels).

Case HPC-05-2016 – 26 E. 3rd Street Local Landmark Application. The applicant is nominating the coach house at 26 E. 3rd Street for designation of a Local Landmark.

Chairman Bohnen reviewed the Findings and Recommendations to the HPC for the next steps of the approval process to the Board of Trustees.

Public Meeting – Certificate of Appropriateness

Case HPC-03-2016 – 134 S. Park Avenue - Proposed additions to the first floor for a new family room, kitchen, prep kitchen and 2-car garage; and additions for the second floor for new bedrooms, closets and bathrooms.

Chairman Bohnen introduced the next item on the agenda as a public meeting for 134 S. Park Avenue. He began by reading typical historic preservation construction methods comments by Commissioner Gonzalez, who is unable to attend the meeting. In short, a design is created initially and worked progressively with the HPC and/or municipal staff for the project. To that end, the last meeting left off for potential alternatives by the applicant. Chairman Bohnen asked the architect if there are any additional thoughts or designs since the last meeting.

Bruce George, of Charles Vincent George Architects, responded no, but reviewed the outreach steps he and the applicant have completed prior to coming up with an appropriate design.

Chairman Bohnen stressed that it is very important for the members of the HPC to feel comfortable with the project prior to voting on the matter. And without Commissioner Gonzalez, who has spent the most time on the application, is hesitant to vote. On the other hand, he expressed that if the applicant would like the HPC to vote, they will.

Ms. Shannon Frey, the owner of the home reviewed the steps prior to submitting the Certificate of Appropriateness application. She echoed Bruce's steps, and that many designs were considered prior to the one submitted to the HPC. She also reviewed that she appreciates historic homes and has lived in several historic homes in the past. Ms. Frey reiterated that the size of the subject property is very large.

Chairman Bohnen expressed that Commissioner Gonzalez's point about the large project was that there should have been design alternatives that preserved more of the historical features of the home.

Reasons for the difficulty of alternative designs based on the lot, home configuration and historic feature locations ensued. Chairman Bohnen commented that purchasing a historic home means owning the floorplans that may not include modern features. On the other hand, Ms. Frey believes if you are not able to update the home, to sell it, it becomes a financial burden, which is a caveat to un-landmarking the home.

Commissioner D'Arco expressed concern for potentially setting precedence if there is not an agreement for the project.

Chairman Bohnen acknowledged that there is more discussion to be had, however, due to a time constraint of having another meeting at 7:30 PM by the Plan Commission, asked for a motion to continue this application. He also prefers that Commissioner Gonzalez is available to vote.

Chairman Bohnen asked for a motion to approve continue the item for the December 14 meeting. Commissioner D'Arco made a motion and Commissioner Willet seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

Public Meeting – Certificate of Appropriateness

Case HPC-04-2016 – 304 S. Lincoln St. - Proposed new front porch in the front yard abutting Lincoln Street; new screened porch and chimney on side yard; and new balustrade and stairs on the corner side yard abutting Third Street.

Chairman Bohnen introduced the next discussion item, with a condition that Commissioner Prisby not vote on the matter since he is the architect of record.

Mr. Peter Coules introduced himself and reviewed that some of the HPC members visited the home at 304 S. Lincoln Street. A few features, such as a synthetic slate roof was agreed upon.

Chairman Bohnen asked if Commissioner D'Arco would like to visit the home himself prior to the HPC voting.

Commissioner D'Arco asked if there are any concerns with the application after visiting the subject property that the HPC needs to highlight.

Chairman Bohnen reviewed the concerns revolved around the substitution of materials, due to the old age of the porch and roof.

Commissioner Prisby reviewed the slate roof, and referenced that Commissioner Gonzalez believed the original home had a slate roof, and would be a great addition to the house.

Chairman Bohnen also clarified that the applicant will not be installing railings on the top of the porches.

Mr. Peter Coules concurred and replied that is a great point.

Chairman Bohnen reviewed that he is comfortable with voting on the matter, since him, Commissioner Gonzalez, the homeowner and architect reviewed the subject property.

Commissioner D'Arco stated that she is comfortable with voting without visiting the home.

Mr. Bohnen asked for a motion to approve the application. Commissioner D'Arco made the motion to continue it for discussion, Commissioner Willet seconded the motion, and the motion passed unanimously (3 Ayes, 1 abstention, and 1 absent)

Signage in the Historic Downtown District

Case A-34-2016 – 42 S. Washington Street (Hollis) – 1 Wall Sign and 1 Blade Sign

Chairman Bohnen introduced the sign application for Hollis, a sign in the downtown Historic District. He reviewed the history of signage review by the HPC and referenced the need for review again due to some interesting new signs. For example, The Eye Doctor wall sign application exhibits do not reflect the actual installed signs, he explained. To that end, he recommends to the Village that signage not be approved unless it is very sure of what the actual sign will look like. Further, if possible, he'd like the HPC to opine on signage at the Garfield Crossing building, even though it is outside the Historic District boundary.

Commissioner Willet expressed his agreement with Chairman Bohnen in regards to the Eye Doctor signage. He added that it is not in keeping with the downtown. Commissioner Prisby and D'Arco echoed the same feelings about the signs.

A brief and positive discussion in support for the Hollis sign application ensued. Chairman Bohnen asked for a motion to approve the sign. Commissioner Prisby motioned, Commissioner D'Arco seconded, and the motion passed unanimously (3 Ayes and 1 absent)

Discussion

Hinsdale Public Library New Ground Sign Discussion – The Memorial Building is a Local Landmark and requires a Certificate of Appropriateness for Signage.

Chairman Bohnen introduced the Hinsdale Public Library ground sign as a discussion item.

Commissioner Prisby explained that he spent a lot of time on this discussion item. He likes the location, the size and reason for it. He explained he's experienced a lot of people asking him for directions to the library. In terms of the design, he believes there should be a 2-inch gap between the cap and the limestone wall in between. A 2-inch reduction in the middle should help the piers stand out better.

Chairman Bohnen asked if he believes it's in keeping with the colonial look to the Memorial Hall building.

Commissioner Prisby explained, from that location, he sees the library and it is in keeping with it, and added the location is not necessarily in the context of the Memorial Hall building.

Chairman Bohnen replied good point.

Commissioner Willet expressed support for the sign and Commissioner Prisby's recommendation to drop the middle down about 2-inches.

Commissioner D'Arco believes it serves a necessary function, however, she thinks it's slightly modern looking.

Commissioner Prisby reiterated his thought that the library side of the area is somewhat more modern in his opinion.

Ms. Karen Keefe, Executive Director of the Hinsdale Library, added that the library is less than 30 years old.

Commissioner Willet asked for Commissioner Prisby's opinion on the color of the brick.

Commissioner Prisby explained it is very hard to match the brick like-for-like, however, since it is not connected to the library, it helps that it's not perfect. His preference is to have it match as close as possible.

Chairman Bohnen believes it's the right sign in the right location.

Additional discussion about the dimensions of the sign ensued.

Chairman Bohnen asked Ms. Keefe if she had any questions or comments she'd like to add.

Ms. Keefe thanked the HPC for their feedback and expressed it's been meaningful and has helped potentially save costs from going back and forth with the sign fabricator.

Commissioner D'Arco asked about the abbreviation for the direction of the street and recommended to keep it consistent with what's on the existing signage in the area.

Ms. Keefe agreed, and will either abbreviate both, or spell them both (direction and "Avenue") out.

Commissioner D'Arco added that it may look more formal if it's spelled out.

Chairman Bohnen concluded the discussion with looking forward to seeing the revision at a future HPC meeting.

2016 Preservation Award to the Village of Hinsdale for the Oak Street Bridge and First Street Brick pavement between Elm Street and Park Avenue.

Chairman Bohnen reviewed that unfortunately the photographs have not been completed yet and discuss it at the next meeting.

Adjournment

With no additional discussion, Commissioner Bohnen asked for a motion to adjourn. Commissioner Gonzalez made the motion and Commissioner D'Arco seconded. The meeting was adjourned at 7:01p.m. on November 9, 2016.

Respectfully Submitted,



, Village Planner